Workshop on physics performance studies at NICA (NICA 2024) November 25–27, 2024

## Experimental Methods and Results of Fluctuation Measurements at RHIC

#### Fan Si

#### University of Science and Technology of China

November 25, 2024



#### Outline

#### • 1. Introduction

- 2. BES-I Measurements
- 3. BES-II Net-Proton Fluctuations
  - Analysis Details
  - Latest Results
- 4. Summary and Outlook

## Introduction: QCD Phase Diagram

- QCD phase transition
  - Hadronic phase ⇔ QGP phase
- Crossover at small  $\mu_{\rm B} \left( \mu_{\rm B} / T < 2 \right)$ 
  - Expected by Lattice QCD
  - $T_{\rm c} = 156.5 \pm 1.5$  MeV at  $\mu_{\rm B} = 0$
- First-order phase transition at higher μ<sub>B</sub>
   Predicted by QCD-based models
- Critical point (CP)?
  - Conjectured to terminate first-order phase boundary



B. Mohanty, N. Xu, arXiv:2101.09210
Y. Aoki *et al.*, Nature 443, 675-678 (2006)
HotQCD, PLB 795, 15-21 (2019)

• Critical physics goal: search for and locate CP, understand QCD phase structure

Fan Si (USTC)

## Introduction: Theoretical Exploration of CP

- Location of crossover
  - Prediction from Lattice QCD at small  $\mu_{\rm B}$

- Location of critical point
  - Sign problem of Lattice QCD at finite  $\mu_{\rm B}$
  - Various predictions from models with approximation/assumption/estimation
  - Wide region:
    - T = 40-180 MeV,  $\mu_{\rm B} = 200-1100$  MeV



• Crucial to search for and locate CP in experiments

A. Pandav et al., PPNP 125, 103960 (2022)

Fan Si (USTC)

## Introduction: Experimental Scan of Phase Diagram

• Scan QCD phase diagram by varying  $\sqrt{s_{NN}}$ 

• Lower energy  $\Rightarrow$  lower T, higher  $\mu_{\rm B}$  at chemical freeze-out

• LHC: 
$$\sqrt{s_{\rm NN}}$$
 at TeV-level,  $\mu_{\rm B} \sim 0$ 

• RHIC-STAR

• Collider: 
$$\sqrt{s_{NN}} = 200-7.7 \text{ GeV}, \mu_{B} = 25-420 \text{ MeV}$$
  
• FXT:  $\sqrt{s_{NN}} = 13.7-3 \text{ GeV}, \mu_{B}$  up to ~750 MeV

• NICA-MPD: 
$$\sqrt{s_{\rm NN}} = 11-4$$
 GeV,  $\mu_{\rm B}$  up to ~620 MeV

• FAIR-CBM, HIAF-CEE:  $\mu_{\rm B}$  up to ~800 MeV



J. Cleymans *et al.*, PRC 73, 034905 (2006)

Fan Si (USTC)

## Introduction: Observables

- Correlation length  $\xi$  and *r*th susceptibility  $\chi_{r,q}$  of conserved charge q = B, Q, S
  - Expected to diverge at CP
  - Reduced by effect of finite size/time
  - Significantly influence higher-order fluctuations
- $C_{r,q}$ : *r*th-order cumulant of event-by-event *q* •  $C_r \sim \xi^{5r/2-3}$ 
  - $C_{r,q} = VT^3 \chi_{r,q}$
  - $C_{r,q}/C_{s,q} = \chi_{r,q}/\chi_{s,q}$ , trivial volume dependence cancelled • Direct comparison with theoretical and model calculations
- $\kappa_{r,q}$ : *r*th-order factorial cumulant
  - Quantification of *r*-particle correlation
  - Usually normalized to  $\kappa_{r,q}/\kappa_{1,q}$





## Introduction: (Factorial) Cumulants

• N: event-by-event net-proton/net-charged-hadron/net-charged-kaon number (proxy for B, Q, S) •  $\mu_r = \langle (N - \langle N \rangle)^r \rangle$ : *r*th-order central moment • Cumulants: •  $C_1 = \mu = \langle N \rangle$ •  $C_2 = \sigma^2 = \mu_2$ Negative skew Positive skew skewness  $S = \mu_3 / \sigma^3 \Leftrightarrow$  asymmetry •  $C_3 = S\sigma^3 = \mu_3$ Gaussian:  $C_r = 0$  (r > 2) •  $C_4 = \kappa \sigma^4 = \mu_4 - 3\mu_2^2$ Poisson:  $C_r = C_1$ ,  $\kappa_r = 0$  (r > 1) •  $C_5 = \mu_5 - 10\mu_3\mu_2$ Skellam (Poisson – Poisson): •  $C_6 = \mu_6 - 15\mu_4\mu_2 - 10\mu_3^2 + 30\mu_2^3$  $C_{\rm odd}/C_{\rm odd} = C_{\rm even}/C_{\rm even} = 1$ kurtosis  $\kappa = \mu_4 / \sigma^4 - 3 \Leftrightarrow$  peakedness • Factorial cumulants: •  $\kappa_1 = C_1$ 0.7 •  $\kappa_2 = C_2 - C_1$ 0.6 0.5 •  $\kappa_3 = C_3 - 3C_2 + 2C_1$ 0.4 •  $\kappa_4 = C_4 - 6C_3 + 11C_2 - 6C_1$ 0.3 •  $\kappa_5 = C_5 - 10C_4 + 35C_3 - 50C_2 + 24C_1$ 0.2 0.1 •  $\kappa_6 = C_6 - 15C_5 + 85C_4 - 225C_3 + 274C_2 - 120C_1$ -3 -2 -1 -5 -4 0 23 1 4

## Introduction: Expected Signals

- Critical signal: non-monotonic energy dependence of  $C_4/C_2$ 
  - $\omega_4$ : scaled  $C_4$
  - Baseline: determined by models without CP
- Larger acceptance  $\Rightarrow$  larger signal
  - More correlations included







Fan Si (USTC)

#### Introduction: STAR Detector System



Fan Si (USTC)

#### **BES-I: Net-Proton Number Fluctuations**



Fan Si (USTC)

Experimental Methods and Results of Fluctuation Measurements at RHIC

10/44

## **BES-I: Net-Charge and Net-Kaon Fluctuations**



STAR, PRL 113, 092301 (2014) STAR, PLB 785, 551-560 (2018)

Fan Si (USTC)

Experimental Methods and Results of Fluctuation Measurements at RHIC

11/44

#### **BES-I: Net-Proton Hyper-Order Fluctuations**



### **BES-II: STAR Major Upgrades**



End-cap TOF (2019+) √s<sub>NN</sub>=3.9 GeV

#### Event Plane Detector (2018+)





Fan Si (USTC)

Experimental Methods and Results of Fluctuation Measurements at RHIC

-0.8 -0.6 -0.4 -0.2 0

Endcap

time-of-flight

0.2 0.4

y-y

Barrel

Time

Chamber

### **BES-II: Data Sets**



• Larger statistics:  $\times$  7–18

• New energies: 9.2 and 17.3 GeV

•  $3 \le \sqrt{s_{\text{NN}}}$  (GeV)  $\le 200 \Rightarrow 750 \ge \mu_{\text{B}}$  (MeV)  $\ge 25$ : high precision, widest  $\mu_{\text{B}}$  coverage to date

A. Pandav (STAR), CPOD 2024 Y. Zhang (STAR), SQM 2024

• BES-II (fixed-target mode)

## Net-Proton: Centrality Determination

Two multiplicity definitions with different acceptances

RefMult3		RefMult3X
BES-I	BES-II	BES-II
w/o iTPC	w/ iTPC	w/ iTPC
$ \eta  < 1.0$	$ \eta  < 1.0$	$ \eta  < 1.6$

Measured charged-particle multiplicities for centrality
(Anti)protons excluded to avoid self-correlation





A. Pandav (STAR), CPOD 2024 Y. Zhang (STAR), SQM 2024 Y. Huang (STAR), RHIC/AGS 2024

Fan Si (USTC)

## Net-Proton: Centrality Determination

Au+Au at  $\sqrt{s_{NN}} = 19.6 \text{ GeV}$ 

**STAR** 

 $10^{-10}$ 

 $10^{-3}$ 

10-4

Normalized no. of Events

Two multiplicity definitions with different acceptances

RefMult3		RefMult3X
BES-I	BES-II	BES-II
w/o iTPC	w/ iTPC	w/ iTPC
$ \eta  < 1.0$	$ \eta  < 1.0$	$ \eta  < 1.6$

Larger multiplicity ⇒ better centrality resolution
 <u>RefMult3X</u> > RefMult3 (BES-II) > RefMult3 (BES-I)



Fan Si (USTC)

Experimental Methods and Results of Fluctuation Measurements at RHIC

Refmult3 (BES-II) Glauber fit

Refmult3X (BES-II)

Refmult3 (BES-I)

0-5%

Glauber fit 0-5%

#### **Net-Proton: Particle Identification**

• (Anti)proton acceptance in this analysis:  $0.4 < p_T (\text{GeV}/c) < 2.0, |y| < 0.5$ 

PID selection criteria for protons and antiprotons

$p_{ m T}$ (GeV/ $c$ )	0.4–0.8	0.8–2.0
Rapidity	y  < 0.5	
Detector	TPC	TPC+TOF
TPC dE/dx	$ n\sigma_{\rm proton}  < 2$	
TOF $m^2$ (GeV <sup>2</sup> / $c^4$ )	/	0.6–1.2



A. Pandav (STAR), CPOD 2024 Y. Zhang (STAR), SQM 2024

- Uniform (anti)proton acceptance in |y| < 0.5 within  $|V_z| < 50$  cm
- Bin-by-bin proton/antiproton purity > 99%

Fan Si (USTC)

## **Event-by-Event Net-proton Number Distributions**

- Raw net-proton number distributions from BES-II
  Uncorrected by
  - detector efficiency

Mean increases with decreasing collision energy
Effect of baryon stopping



A. Pandav (STAR), CPOD 2024 Y. Zhang (STAR), SQM 2024

Fan Si (USTC)

## **Efficiency Correction**

- Assumed binomial response of efficiency:  $B_{\varepsilon,X}(x) = \frac{X!}{x!(X-x)!}\varepsilon^x(1-\varepsilon)^{X-x}$ 
  - $\varepsilon$ : efficiency (binomial probability); X, x: true and measured particle numbers

• Efficiency correction on track-by-track basis

• 
$$C_1^{\text{corr}} = \langle q_{(1,1)} \rangle_c$$
  
•  $C_2^{\text{corr}} = \langle q_{(1,1)}^2 \rangle_c + \langle q_{(2,1)} \rangle_c - \langle q_{(2,2)} \rangle_c$   
•  $C_3^{\text{corr}} = \langle q_{(1,1)}^3 \rangle_c + 3 \langle q_{(1,1)}q_{(2,1)} \rangle_c - 3 \langle q_{(1,1)}q_{(2,2)} \rangle_c + \langle q_{(3,1)} \rangle_c - 3 \langle q_{(3,2)} \rangle_c + 2 \langle q_{(3,3)} \rangle_c$   
•  $C_4^{\text{corr}} = \dots$   
•  $q_{(r,s)} = \sum_{i=1}^x \frac{a_i^r}{\varepsilon_i^s}$ , where  $a_i$  and  $\varepsilon_i$  represents charge and efficiency of the *i*th track

• Differential dependence of efficiency on event and track variables considered

• Event primary vertex position, centrality, track  $p_{\rm T}$  and rapidity

T. Nonaka, M. Kitazawa, S. Esumi, PRC 95, 064912
X. Luo, T. Nonaka, PRC 99, 044917 (2019)
S. He, X. Luo, CPC 42, 104001 (2018)
F. Si, Y. Zhang, X. Luo, CPC 45, 124001 (2021)

• Higher efficiency with iTPC than BES-I, particularly at low  $p_{\rm T}$ 

Fan Si (USTC)

## Centrality Bin Width Correction (CBWC)

• Positive correlation between initial volume and final multiplicity

• Volume varies within a centrality class defined by multiplicity

- Stronger volume fluctuation within a broader centrality class
- Cumulants are calculated in each signal multiplicity bin as the finest centrality class
- Averages are taken within a broad centrality class

• 
$$C_r = \frac{\sum_i n_i C_{r,i}}{\sum_i n_i} = \sum_i w_i C_{r,i}$$

•  $n_i$ : number of events in *i*th multiplicity bin •  $w_i = n_i / \sum_i n_i$ 

X. Luo, J. Xu, B. Mohanty, N. Xu, JPG 40, 105104 (2013) STAR PRC 104, 024902

Fan Si (USTC)



#### **Statistical Uncertainty Estimation**

• Analytical formulae: derived by covariances with various terms of correlations

• Error 
$$(\hat{C}_{r}^{corr}) = \sqrt{\operatorname{Var}(\hat{C}_{r}^{corr})} = \operatorname{Cov}(\hat{C}_{r}^{corr}, \hat{C}_{r}^{corr})$$
  
•  $\operatorname{Cov}(\hat{C}_{r}^{corr}, \hat{C}_{s}^{corr}) \propto \frac{1}{n} \frac{C_{r+s}}{\epsilon^{r+s}}$   
•  $\operatorname{Var}\left(\frac{\hat{C}_{r}}{\hat{C}_{s}}\right) = \frac{\operatorname{Var}(\hat{C}_{r})}{C_{s}^{2}} + \frac{C_{r}^{2} \operatorname{Var}(\hat{C}_{s})}{C_{s}^{4}} - \frac{2C_{r} \operatorname{Cov}(\hat{C}_{r}, \hat{C}_{s})}{C_{s}^{3}}$ 

Bootstrap method: computation-intensive approach
By randomly resampling real data *B* times

• Var(
$$\Phi$$
) =  $\frac{1}{B-1} \sum_{b=1}^{B} \left( \Phi_b - \frac{1}{B} \sum_{b'=1}^{B} \Phi_{b'} \right)^2$ 

• Statistical fluctuations including intrinsic correlations reflected



• Statistical uncertainties estimated through analytical and bootstrap methods are comparable

Fan Si (USTC)



## Systematic Uncertainty Estimation

- Cuts are varied to study systematic variations in results
  - Track quality cuts
  - PID cuts
  - Efficiency varied by a factor of 2% (5% without iTPC in BES-I)

• Barlow check applied to suppress statistical contributions

- For each varied cut,  $Y_{\text{diff}} = Y_{\text{var}} Y_{\text{def}}, \sigma_{\text{stat,diff}}^2 = \sigma_{\text{stat,var}}^2 \sigma_{\text{stat,def}}^2$
- Barlow check requires  $Y_{\text{diff}}^2 > \sigma_{\text{stat,diff}}^2$
- Systematic contribution  $\sigma_{\rm sys} = \sqrt{Y_{\rm diff}^2 \sigma_{\rm stat, diff}^2}$

R. Barlow, arXiv:hep-ex/0207026

Fan Si (USTC)

### Improvements in BES-II

- More collision energies: 9.2 GeV and 17.3 GeV
  - Finer scan of  $\mu_{\rm B}$  in the phase diagram
- Better statistics
  - Event statistics enlarged by a factor of 7–18
  - $\sim 10\%$  higher tracking efficiency from iTPC
- Better systematics
  - Tracking and PID performance improved by iTPC
  - Efficiency uncertainty suppressed from 5% down to 2%
- Better centrality resolution
  - Low- $p_{\rm T}$  tracking enhanced
  - Acceptance expanded

## Reduction factor in uncertainties of $0-5\% C_4/C_2$ in BES-II compared to BES-I

,	7.7 GeV	19.6 GeV
Stat.	4.7	4.5
Sys.	3.2	4

A. Pandav (STAR), CPOD 2024 Y. Zhang (STAR), SQM 2024

Fan Si (USTC)

## Centrality Resolution Effect in UrQMD (19.6 GeV)



- 1. Better centrality resolution ⇒ lower cumulants/ratios (especially in mid-central events) Results from RefMult3A < RefMult3X < RefMult3XE < RefMult3 < RefMult3E
- 2. A saturation of centrality resolution effect observed comparing results from RefMult3A and RefMult3X Measurement using RefMult3X is supported
- 3. For 0–5%  $C_4/C_2$ , weak effect of centrality resolution

Fan Si (USTC)

## Cumulants vs. Centrality and Collision Energy



## Cumulant Ratios vs. Centrality and Collision Energy



Fan Si (USTC)

## Comparison of $C_4/C_2$ with BES-I



A. Pandav (STAR), CPOD 2024 Y. Zhang (STAR), SQM 2024

Fan Si (USTC)

## Effect of Centrality Resolution on $C_4/C_2$

- For  $C_4/C_2$  at 70–80% centrality, clear deviation between RefMult3/3X
  - Smaller difference at higher energy

- For  $C_4/C_2$  at 0–5% centrality, results from RefMult3 and RefMult3X show good agreement with each other
  - Weak effect of centrality resolution



A. Pandav (STAR), CPOD 2024 Y. Zhang (STAR), SQM 2024

Fan Si (USTC)

## Comparison of Energy Dependence with Models

- Smooth energy dependence observed in  $C_2/C_1 \& C_3/C_2$ 
  - $C_4/C_2$  decreases with decreasing energy
- Non-CP models used for comparison
  - 1. Hydro: hydrodynamical model
  - V. Vovchenko *et al.*, PRC 105, 014904 (2022)2. HRG CE: thermal model with canonical treatment of baryon charge
  - P. B Munzinger et al., NPA 1008, 122141 (2021)
  - 3. UrQMD: hadronic transport model

S. A. Bass et al., PPNP, 41, 255 (1998)



A. Pandav (STAR), CPOD 2024 Y. Zhang (STAR), SQM 2024

Fan Si (USTC)

## Comparison of Energy Dependence with Models

- Smooth energy dependence observed in  $C_2/C_1 \& C_3/C_2$ 
  - $C_4/C_2$  decreases with decreasing energy
- Non-CP models used for comparison
  - 1. Hydro: hydrodynamical model
  - V. Vovchenko *et al.*, PRC 105, 014904 (2022)2. HRG CE: thermal model with canonical treatment of baryon charge
  - P. B Munzinger et al., NPA 1008, 122141 (2021)
  - 3. UrQMD: hadronic transport model
  - S. A. Bass et al., PPNP, 41, 255 (1998)
- Proton κ ratios deviate from Poisson baseline at 0
  - Antiproton  $\kappa_3/\kappa_1$  and  $\kappa_4/\kappa_1$  closer to 0
- Clear deviations in net-proton  $C_4/C_2$ and proton  $\kappa$  ratios from models
  - A. Pandav (STAR), CPOD 2024

Y. Zhang (STAR), SQM 2024



Fan Si (USTC)

## Comparison with Expected Critical Signature

- Left column
  - Positive/negative contrib. to cumulants around CP
- Middle column

•  $\omega_r = \kappa_r / \kappa_1$  of protons

- Qualitative consistency
- $\kappa_2/\kappa_1$ : Decrease likely interrupted below 11.5 GeV
- $\kappa_3 / \kappa_1$ : peak at ~11.5 GeV
- $\kappa_4/\kappa_1$ : dip at ~19 GeV, enhancement at lower energy

A. Pandav (STAR), CPOD 2024 Y. Zhang (STAR), SQM 2024 M. Stephanov, arXiv:2410.02861



Fan Si (USTC)

#### Collision Energy Dependence of $C_4/C_2$



•  $C_4/C_2$  (0–5%) shows a minimum at  $\sqrt{s_{\rm NN}} \sim 20$  GeV w.r.t non-CP models and 70–80% data

A. Pandav (STAR), CPOD 2024 Y. Zhang (STAR), SQM 2024

Fan Si (USTC)

## Quantitative Deviations of $C_4/C_2$ from Non-CP Refs.



Fan Si (USTC)

## Quantitative Deviations of $C_4/C_2$ from Non-CP Refs.



• Overall deviation from 7.7 to 27 GeV:  $1.9-5.4\sigma$  (1.4-2.2 $\sigma$  at BES-I)

A. Pandav (STAR), CPOD 2024 Y. Zhang (STAR), SQM 2024

Fan Si (USTC)

## Summary

- Precision measurement of net-proton number fluctuations from STAR BES-II, including collision centrality and energy dependence at  $\sqrt{s_{NN}} = 7.7-27$  GeV
- Compared to BES-I,

better statistical precision, better control on systematics, better centrality resolution.

• Compared to non-critical references (models and peripheral data), central  $C_4/C_2$  shows a maximum deviation at  $\sqrt{s_{\rm NN}} \sim 20$  GeV (3.2–4.7 $\sigma$ ).

#### **Outlook: Acceptance Scan**



• Rapidity extension with iTPC: beyond |y| < 0.5• Differential rapidity scan:  $|y - y_c| < \Delta y/2$ 

B. Ling, M. Stephanov, PRC 93, 034915 (2016)Y. Huang, RHIC/AGS 2024J. Brewer, S. Mukherjee, K. Rajagopal, PRC 98, 061901 (2018)



Experimental Methods and Results of Fluctuation Measurements at RHIC

varying  $\sqrt{s}$ 

Main Scale

cm <sup>0</sup>| ..... <sup>1</sup>| .... <sup>2</sup>| .... <sup>3</sup>| .... <sup>4</sup>| .... <sup></sup>

Scale

varying y

critical

point

## **Outlook: Hyper-Order Fluctuations**



• Measurement of hyper-order fluctuations with better statistics

- Sensitive to crossover signal
- Vulnerable to backgrounds
- Hungry for statistics
- Could provide higher precision in BES-II

A. Bazavov *et al.*, PRD 101, 074502 (2020) STAR, PRL 130, 082301 (2023)

Fan Si (USTC)

## **Outlook: Extended Energy Range (FXT)**



- Crucial to fill in energy gap at 3–7.7 GeV
  μ<sub>B</sub> extended from 420 MeV up to 750 MeV
- Several critical structures expected by FRG



W.-j. Fu, X. Luo, J. M. Pawlowski, F. Rennecke, S. Yin, arXiv:2308.15508

Fan Si (USTC)

## Challenge: Proton Acceptance in FXT Data Sets



- Not fully covered by detectors for  $\sqrt{s_{\rm NN}} > 4.5 \text{ GeV}$
- Might be extended to |y| < 0.5 for  $\sqrt{s_{NN}} = 3$  GeV (Run 21 with iTPC)

• TOF PID required at high momenta with low proton purity: a gap between bTOF and eTOF

Fan Si (USTC)

## Challenge: Half Rapidity Window in FXT analysis

- Models provide quite different results in half and symmetric mid-rapidity windows at √s<sub>NN</sub> = 3 GeV
  -0.5< y < 0</li>
  |y| < 0.5</li>
- Necessary to be studied in energy dependence in experiments

Proton number 
$$C_4/C_2$$
 at  $\sqrt{s_{\rm NN}} = 3 \,{\rm GeV}$ 

$C_4/C_2$	<b>−0.5</b> < <i>y</i> < <b>0</b>	y  < <b>0.5</b>
Data	~ -1	?
UrQMD	~ -1	$\sim -4$
Hydro	~ 1	~ 0



STAR, PRC 107, 024908 (2023)

Fan Si (USTC)

## Challenge: Volume Fluctuation at Low Energy



• Small charged-particle multiplicity at low collision energy

- $N_{\text{part}}$  varies a lot within a centrality class defined by multiplicity
- Bad centrality resolution with large volume fluctuation
- Volume fluctuation correction (HADES, PRC 102, 024914) could help suppress such effect

STAR, PRC 107, 024908 (2023)

Fan Si (USTC)

#### **Outlook: Other Observables**



- Charge-hadron intermittency ( $\nu$ ): BES-I • Triton yield ratio ( $N_t N_p / N_d^2$ ): BES-I • Baryon-strangeness correlation ( $C_{BS}$ )
- Non-monotonic behavior or deviation from non-CP models around 20 GeV

STAR, PLB 845, 138165 (2023) STAR, PRL 130, 202301 (2023) H. Feng (STAR), CPOD 2024



Fan Si (USTC)

## Outlook: Future Facilities/Experiments

More experiments for the physics at high baryon density are anticipated.



B. Mohanty, N. Xu, arXiv:2101.09210

Fan Si (USTC)

#### Acknowledgements

Alphabetically: Xin Dong, ShinIchi Esumi, Yige Huang, Xiaofeng Luo, Bedangadas Mohanty, Bappaditya Mondal, Toshihiro Nonaka, Ashish Pandav, Zachary Sweger, Nu Xu, Yongcong Xu, Xin Zhang, Yifei Zhang, Yu Zhang and STAR Collaboration

## Thanks to organizers for this opportunity.

# Thank you all for your attention!

Fan Si (USTC)